



National ID Cards: Protection or Intrusion?

Celeste Heery

PUAD 700

Spring 2002

Outline

- **Definition of the Ethical Issue**
- **Identification of Alternative Courses of Action**
- **Projection of Possible Consequences**
- **State of Resolution**

Definition of Ethical Issue

- **Not a new issue; has been subject of debate over last 30 years (Social Security Number)**
- **September 11th renewed interest in the subject as potential means to protect Americans from terrorist attacks**

Definition of Ethical Issue

- **Larry Ellison, CEO of Oracle, offered his company's technological resources to develop national ID card**
- **Backlash from privacy and civil liberties groups**

Public Administration Implications

- **Existing Systems**
 - **Department of Defense**
 - **DMVs**
 - **Social Security Administration**

Office of Homeland Security

- **Established within the Office of the President in October 2001 with an Executive Order**
- **Mission: “to develop and coordinate the implementation of a comprehensive national strategy to secure the U.S. from terrorist threats or attacks”**



Office of Homeland Security

- **Focus on coordination and integration with other agencies**

Legal / Legislative Factors

- **Would have to comply with existing laws, such as:**
 - **Immigration Reform and Control Act (1986);**
 - **Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act (1996)**
 - **Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act (1996)**

Legal / Legislative Factors

- **Privacy Act of 1974**
 - **“minimization principle” applies**
 - **Users should have legitimate purpose**
 - **Maintain accurate information**
 - **Citizens must be able to review and correct information**

Legal / Legislative Factors

- **“Congressional Intent”**
 - **“Uniting and Strengthening American by Providing Appropriate Tools Required to Intercept and Obstruct Terrorism” (USA Patriot Act)**

Ethical Arguments – Pro

- **Beneficence**
- **Duty**
- **Responsibility**
- **Promise-Keeping**
- **Dignity**

Ethical Arguments – Anti

- **Fairness**
- **Autonomy**
- **Justice**
- **Trust**
- **Respect**

Identification of Alternative Courses of Action

- **OHS to implement mandatory ID system**
- **OHS will not implement mandatory ID system**
- **OHS will implement voluntary ID system**
- **Modify existing state drivers license system**

Projection of Possible Consequences

- **Mandatory - public/press/privacy groups backlash**
- **Voluntary – wouldn't help**
- **No – could deprive government of potential means to protect Americans from terrorism**
- **Modification of Drivers License System – could help, but many would “fall through the cracks”**

State of Resolution

- **National ID: ends don't justify means**
- **Suggestions:**
 - **Senator Dick Durbin's proposal for commission of study**
 - **AAMVA proposal for uniform program**